



# MILITARY LAW REVIEW

## ARTICLES

COURT-MARTIAL JURISDICTION OVER RETIREES UNDER ARTICLES 2(4)  
AND 2(6): TIME TO LIGHTEN UP AND TIGHTEN UP

*Lieutenant Colonel (Ret.) J. Mackey Ives &  
Lieutenant Colonel (Ret.) Michael J. Davidson*

THE POSSE COMITATUS ACT: SETTING THE RECORD STRAIGHT ON 124 YEARS  
OF MISCHIEF AND MISUNDERSTANDING BEFORE ANY MORE DAMAGE IS DONE

*Commander Gary Felicetti & Lieutenant John Luce*

THE EVOLUTION OF THE LAW OF BELLIGERENT REPRISALS

*Shane Darcy*

A PATRIOT'S HEART: A SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF *An Oral History of  
Colonel William S. Fulton, Jr., United States Army (Retired) (1943-  
1983); and Addendum to Oral History, The Clerk of Court Years  
(1983-1997)*

*Major Mary M. Foreman*

THE FOURTEENTH MAJOR FRANK B. CREEKMORE LECTURE

*Brigadier General (Ret.) Richard J. Bednar*

THE FIFTEENTH WALDEMAR A. SOLF LECTURE IN INTERNATIONAL LAW

*Professor Leslie C. Green*

THE EIGHTH ANNUAL HUGH J. CLAUSEN LECTURE ON LEADERSHIP

*Major General (Ret.) Kenneth D. Gray*

## BOOK REVIEWS

---





# MILITARY LAW REVIEW

---

Volume 175

March 2003

---

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Court-Martial Jurisdiction over Retirees Under Articles 2(4)  
and 2(6): Time to Lighten Up and Tighten Up  
*Lieutenant Colonel (Ret.) J. Mackey Ives &  
Lieutenant Colonel (Ret.) Michael J. Davidson* 1
- The Posse Comitatus Act: Setting the Record Straight on 124 Years  
of Mischief and Misunderstanding Before Any More Damage Is Done  
*Commander Gary Felicetti & Lieutenant John Luce* 86
- The Evolution of the Law of Belligerent Reprisals  
*Shane Darcy* 184
- A Patriot's Heart: A Summary and Analysis of *An Oral History of  
Colonel William S. Fulton, Jr., United States Army (Retired) (1943-  
1983); and Addendum to Oral History, The Clerk of Court Years  
(1983-1997)*  
*Major Mary M. Foreman* 252
- The Fourteenth Major Frank B. Creekmore Lecture  
*Brigadier General (Ret.) Richard J. Bednar* 286
- The Fifteenth Waldemar A. Solf Lecture in International Law  
*Professor Leslie C. Green* 309
- The Eighth Annual Hugh J. Clausen Lecture on Leadership  
*Major General (Ret.) Kenneth D. Gray* 385

### BOOK REVIEWS

- The Paradox of American Power: Why the World's Only Superpower Can't  
Go It Alone*  
Reviewed by *Major John Hyatt* 402
- Winning at the Merit Systems Protection Board: A Step-By-Step Handbook  
for Federal Agency Supervisors, Managers, Lawyers and Personnel Officials*  
Reviewed by *Richard W. Vitaris* 410
- President Bush's Dream Team Goes to War*  
Reviewed by *Lieutenant Colonel David Wallace* 418
- Whose War Is It Anyway? Supreme Command*  
Reviewed by *Major Jeff Spears* 429



Headquarters, Department of the Army, Washington, D.C.

Pamphlet No. 27-100-175, March 2003

---

## **MILITARY LAW REVIEW—VOLUME 175**

Since 1958, the *Military Law Review* has been published at The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia. The *Military Law Review* provides a forum for those interested in military law to share the products of their experience and research, and it is designed for use by military attorneys in connection with their official duties. Writings offered for publication should be of direct concern and import to military legal scholarship. Preference will be given to those writings having lasting value as reference material for the military lawyer. The *Military Law Review* encourages frank discussion of relevant legislative, administrative, and judicial developments.

### **EDITORIAL STAFF**

**CAPTAIN ERIK L. CHRISTIANSEN**, *Editor*

**MR. CHARLES J. STRONG**, *Technical Editor*

The *Military Law Review* (ISSN 0026-4040) is published quarterly by The Judge Advocate General's School, 600 Massie Road, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781, for use by military attorneys in connection with their official duties for \$17 each (domestic) and \$21.25 (foreign) per year (see Individual Paid Subscriptions to the *Military Law Review* on pages vi and vii). Periodicals postage paid at Charlottesville, Virginia and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, 600 Massie Road, ATTN: JAGS-ADL-P, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781.

**SUBSCRIPTIONS:** Private subscriptions may be purchased from the Superintendent of Documents, United States Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402; you may call (202) 512-1800. See the subscription form and instructions at the end of this section. Publication exchange subscriptions are available to law schools and other organizations that publish legal periodicals. Editors or publishers of these periodicals should address inquiries to the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Inquiries and address changes concerning subscriptions for Army legal offices, ARNG and USAR JAGC officers, and other federal agencies should be addressed

to the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Judge advocates of other military services should request distribution from their publication channels.

CITATION: This issue of the *Military Law Review* may be cited as 175 MIL. L. REV. (page number) (2003). Each issue is a complete, separately numbered volume.

#### INDEXING:

- \* The primary *Military Law Review* indices are volume 81 (summer 1978) and volume 91 (winter 1981).
- \* Volume 81 included all writings in volumes 1 through 80, and replaced all previous *Military Law Review* indices.
- \* Volume 91 included writings in volumes 75 through 90 (excluding Volume 81), and replaces the volume indices in volumes 82 through 90.
- \* Volume 96 contains a cumulative index for volumes 92-96.
- \* Volume 101 contains a cumulative index for volumes 97-101.
- \* Volume 111 contains a cumulative index for volumes 102-111.
- \* Volume 121 contains a cumulative index for volumes 112-121.
- \* Volume 131 contains a cumulative index for volumes 122-131.
- \* Volume 141 contains a cumulative index for volumes 132-141.
- \* Volume 151 contains a cumulative index for volumes 142-151.
- \* Volume 161 contains a cumulative index for volumes 152-161.
- \* Volume 171 contains a cumulative index for volumes 162-171.

*Military Law Review* articles are also indexed in *A Bibliography of Contents: Political Science and Government; Legal Contents (C.C.L.P.); Index to Legal Periodicals; Monthly Catalogue of United States Government Publications; Index to United States Government Periodicals; Legal Resources Index*; three computerized databases—the *Public Affairs Infor-*

mation Service, *The Social Science Citation Index*, and *LEXIS*—and other indexing services. Issues of the *Military Law Review* are reproduced on microfiche in *Current United States Government Periodicals on Microfiche* by Infodata International Inc., Suite 4602, 175 East Delaware Place, Chicago, Illinois 60611. The *Military Law Review* is available at <http://www.jagcnet.army.mil> beginning with Volume 154.

**SUBMISSION OF WRITINGS:** Articles, comments, recent development notes, and book reviews should be submitted in Microsoft Word format to the Editor, *Military Law Review*, at [Erik.Christiansen@hqda.army.mil](mailto:Erik.Christiansen@hqda.army.mil). If electronic mail is not available, please forward the submission in duplicate, double-spaced, to the Editor, *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781. Written submissions must be accompanied by an electronic copy on a 3 1/2 inch computer diskette, preferably in Microsoft Word format.

Footnotes should be typed double-spaced, and numbered consecutively from the beginning to the end of the writing, not chapter by chapter. Citations should conform to *The Bluebook, A Uniform System of Citation* (17th ed. 2000), copyrighted by the *Columbia, Harvard, and University of Pennsylvania Law Reviews* and the *Yale Law Journal*, and to *Military Citation* (TJAGSA 7th ed. 2001). Masculine pronouns appearing in the text will refer to both genders unless the context indicates another use.

Typescripts should include biographical data concerning the author or authors. This data should consist of branch of service, duty title, present and prior positions or duty assignments, all degrees (with names of granting schools and years received), and previous publications. If the article was a speech or was prepared in partial fulfillment of degree requirements, the author should include date and place of delivery of the speech or the source of the degree.

**EDITORIAL REVIEW:** The Editorial Board of the *Military Law Review* consists of the Deputy Commandant of The Judge Advocate General's School; the Director of the Legal Research and Communications Department; and the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Professors at the School assist the Editorial Board in the review process. The Editorial Board submits its recommendations to the Commandant, The Judge Advocate General's School, who has final approval authority for writings published in the *Military Law Review*. The *Military Law Review* does not purport to promulgate Department of the Army policy or to be in any sense

directory. The opinions and conclusions reflected in each writing are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of The Judge Advocate General or any governmental agency.

The Editorial Board will evaluate all material submitted for publication. In determining whether to publish an article, note, or book review, the Editorial Board will consider the item's substantive accuracy, comprehensiveness, organization, clarity, timeliness, originality, and value to the military legal community. No minimum or maximum length requirement exists.

When a writing is accepted for publication, the Editor of the *Military Law Review* will provide a copy of the edited manuscript to the author for prepublication approval. Minor alterations may be made in subsequent stages of the publication process without the approval of the author.

Reprints of published writings are not available. Authors receive complimentary copies of the issues in which their writings appear. Additional copies usually are available in limited quantities. Authors may request additional copies from the Editor of the *Military Law Review*.

**BACK ISSUES:** Copies of recent back issues are available to Army legal offices in limited quantities from the Editor of the *Military Law Review*. Bound copies are not available and subscribers should make their own arrangements for binding if desired.

**REPRINT PERMISSION:** Contact the Editor, *Military Law Review*, The Judge Advocate General's School, United States Army, Charlottesville, Virginia 22903-1781.

### Individual Paid Subscriptions to the *Military Law Review*

The Government Printing Office offers a paid subscription service to the *Military Law Review*. To receive an annual individual paid subscription (4 issues), complete and return the order form on the next page.

**RENEWALS OF PAID SUBSCRIPTIONS:** You can determine when your subscription will expire by looking at your mailing label. Check the number that follows “ISSDUE” on the top line of the mailing label as shown in this example:

When this digit is 3, a renewal notice will be sent.

MILR SMITH212J ISSDUE00 <u>3</u> R1 JOHN SMITH 212 MAIN ST FORESTVILLE MD
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

The numbers following ISSDUE indicate how many issues remain in the subscription. For example, ISSDUE001 indicates a subscriber will receive one more issue. When the number reads ISSDUE000, you have received your last issue unless you renew.

To avoid a lapse in your subscription, promptly return the renewal notice with payment to the Superintendent of Documents. If your subscription service is discontinued, simply send your mailing label from any issue to the Superintendent of Documents with the proper remittance and your subscription will be reinstated.

**INQUIRIES AND CHANGE OF ADDRESS INFORMATION:** The individual paid subscription service is handled solely by the Superintendent of Documents, not the Editor of the *Military Law Review* in Charlottesville, Virginia.

For inquires and change of address for individual paid subscriptions, fax your mailing label and new address to (202) 512-2250 or send your mailing label and new address to the following address:

United States Government Printing Office  
Superintendent of Documents  
ATTN: Chief, Mail List Branch  
Mail Stop: SSOM  
Washington, D.C. 20402



\* 5722

**\_\_\_\_\_ Military Law Review**  
**\_\_\_\_\_ Army Lawyer**

**Price includes regular shipping & handling and is subject to change.**

**Purchase order number (optional)**

Mail to: Superintendent of Documents, PO Box 371954, Pittsburgh PA 15250-7954

**Important: Please include this completed order form with your remittance.**

**Phone your orders (202) 512-1800**

(MILR) at \$17 each (\$21.25 foreign) per year.  
(ARLAW) at \$29 each (\$36.25 foreign) per year.

**For privacy protection, check the box below:**

☐ Do not make my name available to other mailers

**Check method of payment:**

Check payable to: **Superintendent of Documents**

[illegible]

☐ VISA ☐ MasterCard ☐ Discover

expiration date
12/31/2011


Authorizing signature \_\_\_\_\_ 1/97